

Familial DNA Searching: Developing a Sustainable Process

Gary Molina
CODIS Program Manager
Texas Dept. of Public Safety
CODIS Laboratory

Trampas Gooding
Staff Lieutenant
Texas Ranger
Texas Dept. of Public Safety

This project was supported by Grant Nos. 2019-AK-BX-0019 and 15PBJA-22-GG-03831 awarded by the Bureau of Justice Assistance. The Bureau of Justice Assistance is a component of the U.S. Department of Justice's Office of Justice Programs, which also includes the Bureau of Justice Statistics, the National Institute of Justice, the Office of Juvenile Justice and Delinquency Prevention, the Office for Victims of Crime, and the SMART Office. Points of view or opinions in this document are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the official position or policies of the U.S. Department of Justice.



Additional Disclaimer: All information contained in this presentation is shared for general informational purposes only and the decision to discuss any pending criminal matters referenced herein rests solely with the Texas Department of Public Safety. The opinions, findings, and conclusions or recommendations expressed in this presentation do not necessarily reflect the views of the Department of Justice or the Bureau of Justice Assistance. To the extent that pending criminal matters are discussed in this presentation, all such charges are merely accusations and all defendants and/or suspects referenced herein are presumed innocent until or unless proven guilty.



Meet the Presenters!



Familial DNA Searching

"An intentional or deliberate search of the database [CODIS] conducted after a routine search for the purpose of potentially identifying close biological relatives of the unknown forensic sample associated with the crime scene profile."

https://www.fbi.gov/services/laboratory/biometric-analysis/codis/codis-and-ndis-fact-sheet

Familial DNA Searching

- Searches the offender index at the state level (SDIS).
- Y-STRs are used to confirm paternal relationship.
- Different than a Partial Match discovered during a regularly scheduled search.
- Different from Forensic Genetic Genealogy (FGG)
 - FGG is law enforcement's use of DNA analysis combined with traditional genealogy research to generate investigative leads for unsolved violent crimes. This allows scientists to identify shared blocks of DNA between a forensic sample and the sample donor's potential relatives.

BJA Grantee Considerations

- If using BJA grant funds, agencies must adhere to the DOJ Interim Policy on FGG.
- In addition, a familial search must be conducted (if allowed).
 - The Designated Lab Official (DLO) should advise the agency on "...the availability of other DNA technologies or techniques." and "...any reasonable scientific alternatives to FGGS Provided

States that Allow (or Have Allowed)
Familial DNA
Searching

1. Denver (Colorado)	2007
2. California	2008
3. Texas	2010
4. Virginia	2011
5. Wyoming	2011
6. Florida	2012
7. Michigan	2013
8. Wisconsin	2014
9. Utah	2014
10. Ohio	2016
11. New York (????)	2017
12. Arizona	2017
13.South Dakota	2017
14. Louisiana	2018
15. North Carolina	2019
16. Minnesota	2020
17. Kentucky	2020

Others?



Bexar County FSC
Weslaco DPS
Corpus Christi DPS
Laredo DPS





Lubbock DPS
Waco DPS
El Paso DPS



UNT



Houston FSC
Harris County IFS
Houston DPS



Austin DPS
Capitol Area
DPS



Garland DPS
Tarrant County ME
SWIFS
Ft. Worth PD

Texas program initiated in 2010

Which cases?

- Unsolved homicide
- Sexual assault
- Other violent crime that has significant public safety concerns

Texas DPS CODIS Laboratory Familial Search Program Considerations for Getting Started

Sought approval through our OGC based on Texas Database Statute.

- Is it allowed/prohibited by Texas database statute?
- Did we need AG opinion?

What resources can we rely on for guidance?

- California DOJ Crime Lab
- UNT

Texas DPS CODIS Laboratory Familial Search Program Considerations for Getting Started

What training and software do we need?

- Cal DOJ Kinship Analysis (R500) through California Criminalistics Institute
- UNT MPKin Software (original software used)
- FBI CODIS Software

What do we need to use for validation

- Actual database samples of related individuals
- Staff family samples
- Y-STR validation
- NIST Standard Reference Family Data (SRFD)

Texas DPS CODIS Laboratory Familial Search Program Considerations for Getting Started

Things that are not as much of a concern anymore:

- Familial searching is now widely accepted.
- Privacy concerns are no longer an issue if the program is performed responsibly.
- No need to reinvent the wheel.

Things that are still a concern:

- Resources both financial and staff.
- Validation of Y-STR testing for a database laboratory.

- Familial searching is a free resource to law enforcement agencies as part of our services.
- Our priority is still focused on testing and uploading qualified individuals into the CODIS database.
- 2010 2019 averaged 5 searches per year.
 - Familial Search sample testing performed by our match verification analyst.
- 2020 2022 averaged 15 searches per year.
 - This created a burden on our resources and budget.

What can we do to help alleviate (not eliminate) the burden?

- We changed our match verification process and Familial Search process to include more scientists.
- SAKI funds were used for:
 - Overtime for analysts
 - The purchase of amplification kits
 - Each search is invoiced to the Texas Rangers and the lab is reimbursed the supply cost
- Validated the CODIS software to perform familial searches in November of 2019*
- Validated direct amp with Y-Filer Plus*
 - Punch into two plates for direct amp of YFP and GFE in March of 2020

Total Number of Familial Searches				
	Pre-SAKI (2010-2019)	SAKI (2020-present)	Non-SAKI (2020-present)	Total
Cases	31	27	5	63
Total Searches	46	33	9	88
Invest. Aided	5	5	2	12
Success Rate by Case	16%	18%	40%	19%
Success Rate by Search	11%	15%	22%	14%

Requests for Familial Searching

- Directed to Texas State CODIS Administrator.
- Submitted by CODIS Forensic Laboratory.
- Must include memos from law enforcement and district attorney.

Laboratory Process

- 13 20 loci for STR and a Y-STR profile (preferably full expanded loci profiles but can proceed with the original 13 CODIS Core loci) – Single source or deduced single source.
- 60 manhours
- \$13K to \$14K per search

Results

- Receive candidate list 1000 to 2000 offenders. Texas CODIS Database has over 1 million offender profiles.
- Evaluate top 150 to 250 offenders. If no match, there are still others lower on the list.
- Can complete one familial search per year (per case).

Delays

- -TXDPS CODIS Laboratory's budget is funded by state legislation. Due to the increased Familial Search Requests, TXDPS CODIS Lab's budget did not have the funding to purchase the additional required materials.
- Delays also occurred with obtaining materials.
- Average turnaround time was six months per case.
- In addition, the lab also must go through the state procurement process in order to contract with vendors for the materials.
 Average time for a state contract to go through the process is one year.

Solutions

- -TXDPS SAKI began funding (with approval by DOJ/BJA) STR and Y-STR kits to alleviate the time restraint.
- In 2021, TXDPS CODIS Lab streamed lined their process by validating and changing kits which reduced the turnaround time down to approximately one month (testing only).
 - Their new process also increased the number of familial searches performed to **four to five searches** per month.

- Texas DPS SAKI
 - -2020 **13 FS requests 6 completed**
 - -2021 9 FS requests 14 completed
 - -2022 **14 FS** requests **13** completed
 - Total 36 FS Requests 33 completed

- 33 Familial Searches completed
 - Average Cost of a Familial Search for material: \$9570
 - Average Cost of a Familial Search for manhours: \$3100
 - Cost to CODIS Laboratory for 32 SAKI FS: \$405,440
 - Cost for materials only: \$306,240
- In April 2022, DOJ/BJA approved FS search reimbursement to DPS CODIS Lab at an average cost of \$9570. Personnel cost already approved.
- From May 2022 to current, there is a reimbursement cost to DPS CODIS Lab of \$66,100 for materials only.

- Rape results in more than \$122,000 in costs per victim and nearly \$3.1 trillion to the economy over the lifetimes of all 25 million victims in the US population.
- For every rape prevented, more than \$122,000 in lifetime costs are averted.



- 7 Sexual Assaults linked by DNA from 2006 to 2016 in San Antonio, TX – 2 others by MO.
- Familial Search Hit to brother who was a known offender and a Texas Seven Escapee who was executed in 2018.
- Michael Anthony Garcia 53 YOA at time of arrest.



- 4 Sexual Assaults linked by DNA one case in 2001 to three cases in 2016.
- Familial Search Hit to two possible brothers who were in CODIS.
- J**** J**** 57 YOA. Pending Indictment



- 1 Single Attempted Sexual Assault 2005. Burglary of Habitation with Intent to Commit Sexual Assault
- Familial Search Hit to possible nephew who was in CODIS.
- Jesse Rodriguez 39 YOA at arrest.



- **5 Sexual Assaults** 1995 to 1998. 4 in Texas and 1 in Louisiana.
- Familial Search Hit to brother who was in CODIS.
- **Eddie J. Bradley** became deceased in 2021 due to a motorcycle accident at the age of 54.

Familial DNA Searching vs. FGG

Familial DNA Searching	FGG
34 cases completed	34 samples submitted (25 completed testing
5 investigative leads generated	8 investigative leads generated
4 suspects identified (3 arrested, 1 deceased)	8 suspects identified (4 arrested, 3 deceased, 1 pending indictment)
1 case being pursued with family members DNA testing	17 cases further pursued with reference testing of possible family members

Resources

- Recommendations from the SWGDAM Adhoc Working Group on Familial Searching
 - https://www.swgdam.org/publications
 - SWGDAM Communications
- U.S. Department of Justice Interim Policy on Forensic Genetic Genealogical DNA Analysis and Searching
 - https://www.justice.gov/olp/page/file/1204386/download
- Process, SOP section
 - CO-05-04 Partial Matches and Familial Searches
 - https://www.dps.texas.gov/section/crime-laboratory/publications

Texas DPS CODIS Program

Gary J. Molina, CODIS Program Manager		
512-424-2385		
Gary.molina@dps.texas.gov		
Christopher Piwonka, CODIS Program Coordinator, FS Contact		
512-424-7935		
Mario Mora and Shekinah Cooper, CODIS Liaison		
512-424-7250		
Tiffany Bazazzadegan, Technical Leader		
512-424-7930		
Jennifer Pollock, CODIS Section Supervisor		
512-424-5532		
Charles Strokes, CODIS Section Supervisor		
512-424-7932		
Rebecca Shane, Local CODIS Administrator		
512-424-7937		

Contact Information

Gary Molina

CODIS Program Manager
Texas Department of Public Safety
CODIS Laboratory
(512)424-2385

Trampas Gooding

Gary.Molina@dps.Texas.gove

Staff Lieutenant, Texas Rangers
Texas Department of Public Safety
SAKI Cold Case Investigation and Prosecution Coordinator
(210) 289-0780

Trampas.Gooding@dps.Texas.gov





Dr. Angela Williamson

U.S. Department of Justice (DOJ), Bureau of Justice Assistance (BJA)

Supervisor, Forensics Unit/Federal Bureau of Investigation Violent Criminal Apprehension Program (ViCAP) Liaison

How SAKI Funds can be used to Support Familial DNA Searching

- Overtime for laboratory personnel
 - Run the searches
 - Evaluate potential familial matches
 - Pull and profile the samples for Y-STRs
- Y-STR testing to evaluate potential familial matches
 - Purchasing of kits and reagents
 - Profiling or outsourcing to a vendor laboratory to help expedite the process
- Investigative activities associated with the location, collection, and analysis of suspect DNA samples for comparison/identification of the actual perpetrator
 - Exhumations are allowable if the suspect is deceased.

Contact Information

Dr. Angela Williamson

DOJ-BJA/FBI

Cell: (202) 598-6443

Angela.Williamson@usdoj.gov

alwilliamson2@fbi.gov

